



General Colin L. Powell, USA (Retired)  
909 North Washington Street  
Suite 700  
Alexandria, Virginia 22314  
October 5, 2005

Dear Senator McCain:

I have read your proposed amendment to the Defense Appropriations Bill concerning the use of the Army Field Manual as the definitive guidance for the conduct of our troops with respect to detainees. I have also studied your impressive statement introducing the amendment.

I fully support this amendment. Further, I align myself with the letter written to you by General Shalikhvili and a distinguished group of senior officers in support of the amendment.

Our troops need to hear from the Congress, which has an obligation to speak to such matters under Article I, Section 8 of the Constitution. I also believe the world will note that America is making a clear statement with respect to the expected future behavior of our soldiers. Such a reaction will help deal with the terrible public diplomacy crisis created by Abu Gharib.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "C.L.P.", written over a horizontal line.

Senator John McCain

General Joseph Hoar, USMC (Ret.)  
General John Shalikashvili, USA (Ret.)  
General Donn A. Starry, USA (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Ron Adams, USA (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Robert G. Gard, Jr., USA (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Jay M. Garner, USA (Ret.)  
Vice Admiral Lee F. Gunn, USN (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Claudia J. Kennedy, USA (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Charles Otstott, USA (Ret.)  
Vice Admiral Jack Shanahan, USN (Ret.)  
Major General Eugene Fox, USA (Ret.)  
Major General John L. Fugh, USA (Ret.)  
Rear Admiral Donald J. Guter, USN (Ret.)  
Major General Fred E. Haynes, USMC (Ret.)  
Rear Admiral John D. Hutson, USN (Ret.)  
Major General Melvyn Montano, ANG (Ret.)  
Major General Robert H. Scales, USA (Ret.)  
Major General Michael J. Scotti, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General David M. Brahms, USMC (Ret.)  
Brigadier General James Cullen, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General Evelyn P. Foote, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General David R. Irvine, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General Richard O'Meara, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General John K. Schmitt, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General Stephen N. Xenakis, USA (Ret.)  
Ambassador/Former Vietnam POW Douglas "Pete" Peterson, USAF (Ret.)  
Former Vietnam POW Commander Frederick C. Baldock, USN (Ret.)  
Former Vietnam POW Commander Phillip N. Butler, USN (Ret.)

September, 2005

Dear Senator McCain:

We strongly support your proposed amendments to the Defense Department Authorization bill concerning detainee policy, including requiring all interrogations of detainees in DOD custody to conform to the U.S. Army's Field Manual on Intelligence Interrogation (FM 34-52), and prohibiting the use of torture and cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment by any U.S. government agency.

The abuse of prisoners hurts America's cause in the war on terror, endangers U.S. service members who might be captured by the enemy, and is anathema to the values Americans have held dear for generations. For many years, those values have been embodied in the Army Field Manual. The Manual applies the wisdom and experience gained by military interrogators in conflicts against both regular and irregular foes. It authorizes techniques

that have proven effective in extracting life-saving information from the most hardened enemy prisoners. It also recognizes that torture and cruel treatment are ineffective methods, because they induce prisoners to say what their interrogators want to hear, even if it is not true, while bringing discredit upon the United States.

It is now apparent that the abuse of prisoners in Abu Ghraib, Guantánamo and elsewhere took place in part because our men and women in uniform were given ambiguous instructions, which in some cases authorized treatment that went beyond what was allowed by the Army Field Manual. Administration officials confused matters further by declaring that U.S. personnel are not bound by longstanding prohibitions of cruel treatment when interrogating non-U.S. citizens on foreign soil. As a result, we suddenly had one set of rules for interrogating prisoners of war, and another for "enemy combatants;" one set for Guantánamo, and another for Iraq; one set for our military, and another for the CIA. Our service members were denied clear guidance, and left to take the blame when things went wrong. They deserve better than that.

The United States should have one standard for interrogating enemy prisoners that is effective, lawful, and humane. Fortunately, America already has the gold standard in the Army Field Manual. Had the Manual been followed across the board, we would have been spared the pain of the prisoner abuse scandal. It should be followed consistently from now on. And when agencies other than DOD detain and interrogate prisoners, there should be no legal loopholes permitting cruel or degrading treatment.

The amendments proposed by Senator McCain would achieve these goals while preserving our nation's ability to fight the war on terror. They reflect the experience and highest traditions of the United States military. We urge the Congress to support this effort.

Sincerely,

General Joseph Hoar, USMC (Ret.)  
General John Shalikashvili, USA (Ret.)  
General Donn A. Starry, USA (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Ron Adams, USA (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Robert G. Gard, Jr., USA (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Jay M. Garner, USA (Ret.)  
Vice Admiral Lee F. Gunn, USN (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Claudia J. Kennedy, USA (Ret.)  
Lieutenant General Charles Otstott, USA (Ret.)  
Vice Admiral Jack Shanahan, USN (Ret.)  
Major General Eugene Fox, USA (Ret.)  
Major General John L. Fugh, USA (Ret.)  
Rear Admiral Donald J. Guter, USN (Ret.)  
Major General Fred E. Haynes, USMC (Ret.)  
Rear Admiral John D. Hutson, USN (Ret.)  
Major General Melvyn Montano, ANG (Ret.)

Major General Robert H. Scales, USA (Ret.)  
Major General Michael J. Scotti, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General David M. Brahms, USMC (Ret.)  
Brigadier General James Cullen, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General Evelyn P. Foote, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General David R. Irvine, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General Richard O'Meara, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General John K. Schmitt, USA (Ret.)  
Brigadier General Stephen N. Xenakis, USA (Ret.)  
Ambassador/Former Vietnam POW Douglas "Pete" Peterson, USAF (Ret.)  
Former Vietnam POW Commander Frederick C. Baldock, USN (Ret.)  
Former Vietnam POW Commander Phillip N. Butler, USN (Ret.)

**General Joseph Hoar, USMC (Ret.)**

General Hoar served as Commander-in-Chief, U.S. Central Command. After the first Gulf War, General Hoar led the effort to enforce the naval embargo in the Red Sea and the Persian Gulf, and to enforce the no-fly zone in the south of Iraq. He oversaw the humanitarian and peacekeeping operations in Kenya and Somalia and also supported operations in Rwanda, and the evacuation of U.S. civilians from Yemen during the 1994 civil war. He was the Deputy for Operations for the Marine Corps during the Gulf War and served as General Norman Schwarzkopf's Chief of Staff at Central Command. General Hoar currently runs a consulting business in California.

**General John Shalikashvili, USA (Ret.)**

General Shalikashvili was Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff (Department of Defense) from 1993 till 1997. Prior to serving as Chairman, he served as NATO's Supreme Allied Commander for Europe, and also as the commander-in-chief of the United States European Command. He was until recently a visiting professor at The Stanford Institute for International Studies.

**General Donn A. Starry, USA (Ret.)**

General Starry served in the U.S. Army for thirty-five years, led combat operations in Korea and Vietnam, and helped draw up battle plans for Operation Desert Storm. He last served as the Commander-in-Chief of US Readiness Command.

**Lt. General Ron Adams, USA (Ret.)**

General Adams served in the U.S. Army for 36 years. He last served as Commanding General, US Army North Atlantic Treaty Organization with concurrent duty as Deputy Commander, Joint Headquarters Centre, Allied Command Europe. Other positions General Adams held included Commander, NATO Stabilization Force (SFOR) Bosnia-Herzegovina and Croatia.

**Lt. General Robert G. Gard, Jr., USA (Ret.)**

General Gard is a retired Lieutenant General who served in the United States Army; his military assignments included combat service in Korea and Vietnam. He is currently a consultant on international security and president emeritus of the Monterey Institute for International Studies.

**Lt. General Jay M. Garner, USA (Ret.)**

General Garner served in the Army for 35 years. His last active job was Assistant Vice Chief of Staff, United States Army. He was also the Director of Reconstruction and Humanitarian Assistance for Iraq prior to Ambassador Bremer's appointment.

**Vice Admiral Lee F. Gunn, USN (Ret.)**

Admiral Gunn served as the Inspector General of the Department of the Navy until his retirement in August 2000. Admiral Gunn commanded the USS BARBEY and the Destroyer Squadron "Thirty-one," a component of the U.S. Navy's Anti-Submarine Warfare Destroyer Squadrons. Gunn is from Bakersfield, California and is a graduate of the University of California, Los Angeles. He received his commission from the Naval ROTC program at UCLA in June 1965.

**Lt. General Claudia J. Kennedy, USA (Ret.)**

General Kennedy is the first and only woman to achieve the rank of three-star general in the United States Army. Kennedy served as Deputy Chief of Staff for Army Intelligence, Commander of the U.S. Army Recruiting Command, and as Commander of the 703d military intelligence brigade in Kunia, Hawaii.

**Lt. General Charles Otstott, USA (Ret.)**

General Otstott served 32 years in the Army. As an Infantryman, he commanded at every echelon including command of the 25th Infantry Division (Light) from 1988-1990. His service included two combat tours in Vietnam. He completed his service in uniform as Deputy Chairman, NATO Military Committee, 1990-1992.

**Vice Admiral Jack Shanahan, USN (Ret.)**

Admiral Shanahan served in the Navy for 35 years before his retirement in 1977. A former commander of the North Atlantic fleet, Admiral Shanahan served in combat in WWII, Korea and Vietnam.

**Major General Eugene Fox, USA (Ret.)**

General Fox retired in 1989 after 33 years of service in the U.S. Army. His last active duty position was the Deputy Director of the Strategic Defense Initiative Office.

**Major General John Fugh, USA (Ret.)**

General Fugh was The Judge Advocate General of the U.S. Army, retiring from that post in July 1993 as a Major General. General Fugh was 15 years old when he migrated to the United States with his family from China. He was the first Chinese-American to attain General officer status in the U.S. Army. General Fugh currently lives in the Washington, D.C. metropolitan area.

**Rear Admiral Don Guter, USN (Ret.)**

Admiral Guter served in the U.S. Navy for 32 years, concluding his career as the Navy's Judge Advocate General from 2000 to 2002. Admiral Guter currently serves as the Dean of Duquesne University Law School in Pittsburgh, PA.

**Major General Fred Haynes, USMC (Ret.)**

General Haynes is a veteran of World War II, Korea and Vietnam. He was an infantry officer for 35 years and commanded the second Marine division and the third Marine division. He was also the senior member of the U.S. military at the U.N. military armistice at Pat, Mun Jom, Korea.

**Rear Admiral John D. Hutson, USN (Ret.)**

Admiral John D. Hutson served as the Navy's Judge Advocate General from 1997 to 2000. Admiral Hutson now serves as President and Dean of the Franklin Pierce Law Center in Concord, New Hampshire.

**Major General Melvyn Montano, ANG (Ret.)**

General Montano was the adjutant general in charge of the National Guard in New Mexico from 1994 to 1999. He served in Vietnam and was the first Hispanic Air National Guard officer appointed as an adjutant general in the country.

**Major General Robert H. Scales, USA (Ret.)**

General Robert Scales served more than 35 years in the U.S. Army. He commanded two units in Vietnam, winning the silver star for action during the battles around Dong Ap Bia (Hamburger Hill) during the summer of 1969. Subsequently he served in command and staff positions in the United States, Germany, and Korea and ended his military career as Commandant of the United States Army War College.

**Major General Michael J. Scotti, USA (Ret.)**

General Scotti served over 30 years from battalion surgeon in the Vietnam conflict to commanding all Army medical forces in Europe following the dissolution of the Soviet Union and during the conflicts in the former Yugoslavia.

**Brigadier General David M. Brahms, USMC (Ret.)**

General Brahms served in the Marine Corps from 1963-1988. He served as the Marine Corps' senior legal adviser from 1983 until his retirement in 1988. General Brahms currently practices law in Carlsbad, California and sits on the board of directors of the Judge Advocates Association.

**Brigadier General James Cullen, USA (Ret.)**

General Cullen is a retired Brigadier General in the United States Army Reserve Judge Advocate General's Corps and last served as the Chief Judge (IMA) of the U.S. Army Court of Criminal Appeals. He currently practices law in New York City.

**Brigadier General Evelyn P. Foote, USA (Ret.)**

General Foote was Commanding General of Fort Belvoir in 1989. She was recalled to active duty in 1996 to serve as Vice Chair of the Secretary of the Army's Senior Review Panel on Sexual Harassment. She is President of the Alliance for National Defense, a non-profit organization.

**Brigadier General David R. Irvine, USA (Ret.)**

General Irvine is a retired Army Reserve strategic intelligence officer and taught prisoner interrogation and military law for 18 years with the Sixth Army Intelligence School. He last served as Deputy Commander for the 96th Regional Readiness Command, and currently practices law in Salt Lake City, Utah.

**Brigadier General Richard O'Meara, USA (Ret.)**

Brigadier General Richard O'Meara is a combat decorated veteran who fought in Vietnam before earning his law degree and joining the Army's Judge Advocate General Corps. He retired from the Army Reserves in 2002 and now teaches courses on Human Rights and History at Kean University and at Monmouth University.

**Brigadier General John K. Schmitt, USA (Ret.)**

General Schmitt served in the U.S. Army for 29 years. He was Assistant Chief of Staff for Operations, Kosovo Forces (KFOR), from late-1999 through mid-2000. He directed military operations there that restored security in the country and provided operational strategic direction for the international community to carry out humanitarian, social and economic programs.

**Brigadier General Stephen N. Xenakis, USA (Ret.)**

Dr. Stephen N. Xenakis has served in the U.S. Army, as well as in healthcare management, academic medicine, and clinical practice. He retired from the Army in 1998 at the rank of Brigadier General and held many high level positions, including Commanding General of the Southeast Regional Army Medical Command. He currently serves as the Director of Child and Adolescent Psychiatry at the Psychiatric Institute of Washington.

**Ambassador Douglas "Pete" Peterson, USAF (Ret.)**

Ambassador Peterson served as the ambassador to the Socialist Republic of Vietnam until 2001. Prior to his diplomatic posting, Ambassador Peterson served three terms as a member of the United States House of Representatives, representing the Second Congressional District of Florida. He served 26 years in the United States Air Force having served in worldwide assignments as a fighter pilot and commander. He is a distinguished combat veteran of the Vietnam War and was incarcerated as a POW during that conflict for more than six years. He completed his military service in 1981 and has extensive experience in the private sector.

**Commander Frederick C. Baldock, USN (Ret.)**

Commander Baldock was a Navy pilot and is a combat veteran of the Vietnam War. His plane was shot down over North Vietnam in 1966, and he spent seven years in captivity as a POW.

**Commander Phillip N. Butler, USN (Ret.)**

Commander Butler was a Navy pilot and is a combat veteran of the Vietnam War. His plane was shot down over North Vietnam in 1965, and he spent nearly eight years in captivity as a POW.